

1 IAN GERSHENGORN
 Deputy Assistant Attorney General
 2 MELINDA L. HAAG
 United States Attorney
 3 VINCENT M. GARVEY
 Deputy Branch Director
 4 JOSHUA E. GARDNER
 District of Columbia Bar No. 478049
 Trial Attorney
 Telephone: (202) 305-7583
 5 Facsimile: (202) 616-8470
 6 Email: Joshua.E.Gardner@usdoj.gov

7 KIMBERLY L. HERB
 Illinois Bar No. 6296725
 Trial Attorney

8 LILY SARA FAREL
 North Carolina Bar No. 35273
 Trial Attorney

9 BRIGHAM J. BOWEN
 District of Columbia Bar No. 981555
 Trial Attorney

10 JUDSON O. LITTLETON
 Texas Bar. No. 24065635
 Trial Attorney
 Civil Division, Federal Programs Branch
 11 U.S. Department of Justice
 12 P.O. Box 883
 13 Washington, DC 20044

14 Attorneys for DEFENDANTS

15
 16 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
 17 NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA
 18 OAKLAND DIVISION

19
 20 VIETNAM VETERANS OF AMERICA, *et al.*,

21 Plaintiffs,

22 v.

23 CENTRAL INTELLIGENCE AGENCY, *et al.*,

24 Defendants.

Case No. CV 09-0037-CW

**DEFENDANTS' REPLY TO
 PLAINTIFFS' STATEMENT OF
 DISCOVERY DISPUTES, AND
 MOTION TO SET A BRIEFING
 SCHEDULE**

1 Defendants file this brief reply because they object to both the timing of the briefing
2 proposed in Plaintiffs' opposition and the requested page limitations. With respect to the timing
3 of Defendants' response to Plaintiffs' discovery dispute statement, Defendants proposed in their
4 opposition a June 7, 2012 deadline. Dkt. 426. Plaintiffs' response, however, proposes a deadline
5 nine days earlier on May 29, 2012. Plaintiffs' proposed deadline fails to acknowledge both the
6 upcoming Memorial Day holiday weekend and the fact that Defendants must work with agency
7 counsel to develop multiple declarations in response to aspects of the forty-paragraph
8 "supplemental and amended" declaration of John Ashley that Plaintiffs only recently provided to
9 Defendants. Indeed, as noted in Defendants' Motion to Set a Briefing Schedule, Plaintiffs are
10 briefing for the very first time issues related to the Central Intelligence Agency's ("CIA") review
11 of certain magnetic tapes that previously have not been subject to any discovery dispute, and
12 Plaintiffs only days ago offered a declaration that purports to address those issues. Dkt. 426 at 2.
13 The CIA, however, will not be able to adequately and fully respond to the arguments raised in
14 Plaintiffs' statement and declaration by May 29, 2012; agency counsel for the CIA was
15 unavailable last week due to pressing national security matters, and agency counsel further is
16 scheduled to be out of town May 25-28, 2012. While Plaintiffs suggest that Defendants'
17 proposed schedule somehow will delay the resolution of the issues identified in Plaintiffs'
18 discovery dispute statement, a difference of nine days will have no legitimate impact on the
19 timely resolution of these issues, but will provide a reasonable time in which Defendants can
20 respond to Plaintiffs' arguments.

21 Furthermore, Plaintiffs proposed page limitation of eight pages is inappropriate. As
22 mentioned in Defendants' opposition, Plaintiffs' eight page statement cross-references another six
23 page brief concerning cost-shifting that Defendants have not had the opportunity to respond to, as
24 well as the forty paragraph "amended and supplemental" declaration of Mr. Ashley.
25 Accordingly, if the Court is inclined to impose page limitations, Defendants suggest that they be
26 allowed at least 15 pages.

27
28 Respectfully submitted,

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

May 22, 2012

IAN GERSHENGORN
Deputy Assistant Attorney General
MELINDA L. HAAG
United States Attorney
VINCENT M. GARVEY
Deputy Branch Director

/s/ Joshua E. Gardner
JOSHUA E. GARDNER
KIMBERLY L. HERB
LILY SARA FAREL
BRIGHAM JOHN BOWEN
JUDSON O. LITTLETON
Trial Attorneys
U.S. Department of Justice
Civil Division, Federal Programs Branch
P.O. Box 883
Washington, D.C. 20044
Telephone: (202) 305-7583
Facsimile: (202) 616-8202
E-mail: Joshua.E.Gardner@usdoj.gov

Attorneys for Defendants